

ב"ה

Au contraire!

The Ins-and-Outs of Contradicting Parents, Teachers and Rabbis.

Table of Contents

CONTRADICTING ONE'S PARENT	1
DIFFERENCE OF OPINION	3
REBBI AND REBBI MUVHAK	4
CONTRADICTING A GADOL HADOR	6
RESPECTING A TEACHER	8
HONORING ELDERS	8

Questions

1. May one contradict a parent for the sake of learning?
2. Do similar laws apply to teachers, elders, and *gedolim* as well?
3. Does Halachah differentiate between a *rebbe* and *rebbe muvhak*?
4. In terms of "elders" (in age—not a sage), is there any problem with contradicting or agreeing? In other words, one may not agree with a parent in a dispute because who are you to agree. But does this apply in the case of an elderly person also?
5. Under what conditions may one disagree with a *gadol* (assuming that the *gadol* is not your *rebbe*)?

Contradicting One's Parent

The Talmud cites a Baraisa which enumerates a number of examples that are included in the Biblical commandment¹ to fear one's parent: "One may not stand in his place, sit in his place, contradict his words, or choose a side [in an argument]."²

The *poskim* differ over the meaning of "choosing a side."

- (1) Rashi explains that if one's father and another scholar are disputing a legal matter (*dvar Halachah*), one may not say, "The opposing scholar's opinion appears to be correct."³

(1) ויקרא (יט, ג): איש אמו ואביו תיראו.

(2) קידושין (לא, ב): ת"ר: איזהו מורא, ואיזהו כיבוד? מורא - לא עומד במקומו, ולא יושב במקומו, ולא סותר את דבריו, ולא מכריעו.

